

Between Denial and Celebrityization: Online Media Coverage of Climate Change in Slovenia and Croatia

Vesna Kalajžić*

Marijana Ražnjević Zdrilić**

Dejan Jontes***

SUMMARY

The phenomenon of global warming and its consequences are challenges we face in modern society. In addition to these issues, the paper is motivated by media reports on the 2019 worldwide climate strikes and the UN Climate Action Summit, held in New York in September of the same year. Swedish climate activist Greta Thunberg, whose performance at the Summit sparked a lot of interest in the media worldwide, found herself in the centre of media attention. The goal of this paper is to explore the image of climate change presented on Croatian and Slovenian online portals, which were selected based on their readership (tracked using Alexa.com). These included Croatian online portals: 24sata.hr, Index.hr, Net.hr, Narod.hr, Vecernji.hr, Net.hr, and Slovenian online portals: 24ur.com, nova 24TV, SIOL.net, Slovenske novice, Svet24, TV SLO. The paper applies the method of qualitative and quantitative content analysis. The research corpus consisted of 194 articles published in Croatian and Slovenian online media (136 and 58 respectively). The research focuses on the scope of reporting on climate change, identification of the main topics and attitudes, and the question of celebrityization of the issue itself. Research results showed that there are significant

*Vesna Kalajžić, assistant professor, Department of Tourism and Communication Studies, University of Zadar, Ul. dr. Franje Tuđmana 24i, 23000 Zadar, e-mail: vesna@unizd.hr

**Marijana Ražnjević Zdrilić, assistant professor, Department of Tourism and Communication Studies, University of Zadar, Ul. dr. Franje Tuđmana 24i, 23000 Zadar, e-mail: mraznje@unizd.hr

***Dejan Jontes, associate professor, Department of Media and Communication Studies, Faculty of Social Sciences, University of Ljubljana, Kardeljeva ploščad 5, 1000 Ljubljana, e-mail: dejan.jontes@fdv.uni-lj.si

differences when it comes to the framing of climate change issues, particularly Greta Thunberg's activism, in Croatian and Slovenian online media.

Keywords: climate change, comparative content analysis, textual analysis, celebrityzation, online media, Croatia, Slovenia

Introduction

The phenomenon of global warming and the consequence of that process, climate change, represents one of the most pressing problems facing modern society, especially so after the 2021 IPCC (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change) special report about the impacts of 1.5 °C global warming above pre-industrial levels. In the media, this phenomenon has been considered and discussed more intensively only after the Conference on Climate Changes in Copenhagen organised by the UN in December 2009 (Šverko-Grdić, Krstinić Nižić, Mamula 2017). Important legal and political framework which referred to facing the global problem – climate change, was the Paris Agreement. This global agreement on climate change was signed on 12 December 2015 in Paris, and its basic goal was to limit global warming to a level “significantly lower” than 2 °C. This goal refers to the period from the year 2020 onwards (Paris Agreement, 2019).

Schäfer and Schlichting (2014: 143) make a strong point that climate change is not easily perceivable as it usually described on large temporal and spatial scales, descriptions of the climate changes are usually complex and are produced by science and similar can be said about the effects of climate change. Consequently, most people learn about climate change from the media (Schäfer and Schlichting, 2014: 143). Although research so far has focused mostly on print media, Koteyko and Atanasova (2016) argue that over the last two decades communication about climate science and policy has been profoundly influenced by the internet.

At the backdrop of these developments, the paper analyses reporting about climate change in two neighboring countries in South-Eastern Europe across a variety of online media and with a combination of quantitative and qualitative approaches. In the first instance, a question why climate change has received increased media attention only in the last years is also approached. As Trumbo and Shanahan (2000) contended two decades ago, accurate measurements of atmospheric carbon dioxide levels began as early as in 1957 and scientists have been concerned about the effect that humans might be having on the atmosphere through the emission of carbon dioxide and other greenhouse gases since the close of the nineteenth century. What

has changed in highly mediatized societies and how are the digital media contributing to the variety of narratives about climate change? How does, for example, celebritization of climate change contribute to the issue salience?

In Croatia and Slovenia, there is no continuous research on public perceptions of climate change, and pursuant to research on climate change conducted until today it has been determined that subjects have a certain degree of information on the mentioned subject (Ančić, Puđak, Domazet, 2016). Still, it is also necessary to emphasise that in the last years in certain societies, among other things, an overload with the theme of climate changes appears (climate fatigue) (Capstick et al. 2015 according to Ančić, Puđak, Domazet, 2016). Moreover, van Eck et al (2019) emphasize political polarization over the issue of climate change and they see one possible explanation for the discrepancy between scientific consensus and divided public opinion in the media representations of climate change over years.

The paper contributes to the understanding how scientific information takes shape in the online media in the case of climate change in both countries. Since climate change is a global issue, and that the media as a social phenomenon under influence of modern information-communication technology also acts globally, it is completely clear that scientists throughout the world sought to demonstrate a media picture of climate change. The goal of this paper is to contribute to the research of media coverage of climate change. Moreover, Schäfer and Schlichting (2014) conducted a meta-analysis of research of media representations of climate change and accentuated the field's strong concentration on Western countries and print media. With a focus on online media in two South European post-socialist countries our study consequently aims to shed some light on different media context also.

Literature review: Dominance of framing and agenda-setting approaches in analyzing reporting about climate change

In the last years, reporting about climate change has been extensively studied through various approaches and theories but framing and agenda-setting can nevertheless be identified as the most frequently used. For example, Shi et al (2019, 1) conducted computational linguistic analysis based on the large-scale data acquired from the online knowledge community Quora to address the climate change communication from the agenda setting perspective. As the majority of other researchers, they also accentuate that certain narrative strategies may make climate change issues more salient by engaging public into discussion or evoking their long-term interest.

Trumbo and Shanahan (2000: 201) have emphasized a connection between the con-

tent of the mediated information environment and the state of public understanding which can be especially strong for national or international issues that have low intrusiveness in the present, have distant time horizons, and have high levels of conflict. According to them climate change embodies all these characteristics and that is why the research on the public understanding of climate change operates under the global hypothesis that cycles in media coverage embody narratives that guide public understanding (ibid.).

Romps and Retzinger (2019) focused on the presence or absence of basic scientific facts about climate change in New York Times news articles about this subject. In their analysis of nearly six hundred news articles in The New York Times that cover climate change, they established that, with one exception, basic climate facts appear in those articles today with vanishingly small frequencies. Brüggemann and Engesser (2014) focused on climate journalists as key mediators between the sphere of science and the public sphere. In their study they surveyed journalists from five countries and five different types of news outlets and emphasized that despite of all the differences between journalists working in vastly different contexts, there is a common ground regarding interpretations of climate change, assessment and handling of climate change skeptics, expertise in climate coverage, and usage of sources. They claim that climate journalists constitute an interpretive community (Brüggemann and Engesser, 2014: 419). Van Eck et al (2019) on the other hand established in their analysis that the journalistic norms of traditional journalists identified by Boykoff and Boykoff (2007) are not identical to the journalistic norms of climate change bloggers. The norms personalization, dramatization, and novelty were supported by some interviewees in their sample, but not by everyone.

Schäfer et al (2014) tried to identify the drivers of media attention for climate change in three countries: Australia, Germany, and India. They calculated the monthly amount of climate change-related coverage in two leading newspapers for each country in relation to all articles published in the respective newspapers over a 15-year time span (1996–2010). The results show that weather and climate characteristics are no important drivers for issue attention in two of the three countries, and that societal activity, particularly international climate summits and the agenda building efforts from international nongovernmental organizations, has stronger impacts on issue attention. Günay et al (2018) on the other hand adopted content analysis to answer the question how the mainstream and alternative media frame climate change in the Turkish context. Their analysis of data from three periods between 2007 and 2015 indicated alternative media's potential to serve as "alternative public sphere" by voicing the unspoken in public debate on climate change. Focusing only on India, Keller et al. (2019) used automated content analysis to identify themes

and topics of climate change reporting. They demonstrate that climate change has gained more media attention since 2007 in general with a particular increase in focus on the theme of climate change impacts. In the content analysis of newspaper coverage of international climate politics in five countries KönigsLöw et al (2019) highlight a shift in the arguments used over their 10-year period of analysis where a shift to questions of fairness in the distribution of costs and gains occurred.

Among other contexts, climate change has also been discussed in the context of moral panics (Rohloff, 2019), but in our study, we would especially like to draw on a more specific literature that deals with journalism, its characteristics, and conventions in connection with the reporting about climate change. Among these studies, examining journalist's as interpretive communities, studying journalism norms, and examining climate change reporting in the context of tabloidization should be mentioned as important directions of research.

Boykoff's (2008) study of representations of climate change in UK tabloids from 2000 to 2006 showed that news articles on climate change were predominantly framed through weather events, charismatic megafauna and the movements of political actors and rhetoric, while few stories focused on climate justice and risk. In addition, headlines with tones of fear, misery and doom were most prevalent. In the last years, research employing discourse analysis has become more frequent in analysing climate change communication. Koteyko and Atanasova (2016) highlight four main areas where discourse analysis has proved useful for assessing climate change communication and media representations. Firstly, in identifying discourses in a broad sense as socially, politically and historically situated constellations of meaning; secondly, in revealing the strategies for constructing social actors and social identities; thirdly, in examining the visual aspects of climate change representations, and, lastly, in analysing the form and function of linguistic constructs from a critical perspective.

Moreover, in relation to social actors, the concept of celebritization has proven useful. Boykoff and Goodman (2009: 396) maintain that celebritization poses interesting and complex questions about the idea that celebrities might actually open up space in the public sphere and the science/policy nexus through the creation of a novel form of 'expertise' or 'authorized speakers'. The second idea they introduce suggests how the celebrity as the 'heroic individual' may entrench the focus of climate change actions through individualist frames (ibid.). Both ideas are interesting and relevant for our analysis of the representation of Greta Thunberg in the second part of the paper. Drawing on Chouliaraki, Murphy argues that Greta Thunberg is the ideal performer for a youth centered climate change movement "in that her meteoric rise to global eco-celebrity has been media-centric while still being remarkably resistant to co-optation within the broader climate change politics" (2021: 193)

Method and sample

On the sample of Slovenian and Croatian media we researched, analysed, and compared coverage of the media in Slovenia and Croatia on climate change. The analysed unit was an article in the researched media. We have analysed a total of 194 articles, 136 from Croatian media and 58 from Slovenian. We focused on the media with the highest traffic in both countries according to the site Alexa.com, a service for tracking Internet traffic. According to that criterion, for Slovenia these were: 24ur.com, nova 24TV, SIOL.net, Slovenske novice, Svet24, TV SLO, and for Croatia: 24sata.hr, Index.hr, Net.hr, Narod.hr, Vecernji.hr. Net.hr - portal (www.net.hr) is owned by Telegram media grupa d.o.o. The former name of this portal is www.Iskon.hr, and the change in the name of the portal was due to a change in the ownership structure, after www.net.hr became the property of Adriatic Media doo. The main sections of the portal are: today, sports, hot, magazine, webcafé and video. Index.hr was launched on December 2, 2002. The initiator and editor-in-chief of the portal is Matija Babić (2017). According to Jakopović and Mikelić Preradović, Index.hr is an independent online portal without an additional media format and is characterized by the number of user comments. (Jakopović, Mikelić Preradović, 2016: 68), narod.hr -the imprint of this portal states that “they try to objectively inform the public about all important topics from Croatia and the world and those topics that cannot be read in other media. “They also state the following characteristics: “independent, current, relevant, objective, different” (Narod, 2021); 24sata.hr-The first issue of 24sata was published on March 2, 2005. It appears on the Croatian media market as the first tabloid (Ivanuš, 2020: 111)

According to the research of GemiusAudience (2021) 24sata.hr is the most visited portal in Croatia; vecernji.hr portal is specific in that it was among the first in South-east Europe to start applying a convergent way of working. Shortly after the launch, it immediately had a large attendance. It consists of the following sections: News, Sports, Lifestyle, Vecernji.tv, Gallery and Blog (Brautović, 2011: 29).

The selected media are thus a combination of legacy media and digital-born new media organisations. The later are especially important as they pursue editorial innovation by selecting different stories, angles or themes, and introducing voices not so often found in legacy media (see Painter et al, 2018: 3).

Content analysis was used as a research method in the first part of the paper. According to Plačko, content analysis is one of the most frequently used methods for the analysis of mass media (Plačko, 1990: 49). Stojak has a similar view, pointing out the most common use of this method in various journalistic texts. It also lists some of the advantages of this method: it is very precise and has great possibilities

of adaptation (Stojak, 1990: 259, 269). We also wanted to research the differences in media coverage of climate change between public and commercial media. Therefore, we included public service media portals in the research corpus, in Croatia HRT and in Slovenia MMC RTVSLO.

In the qualitative part of the analysis we conducted textual analysis of articles that focused on climate activist Greta Thunberg from Sweden as she represents the main theme of the analyzed articles in the quantitative part. This part of the study is exploratory and draws on a sample of 50 texts from both countries time and where difference in reporting between the two countries is one of our central concerns. Inductive approach to the data was adopted, all authors read through all the texts and tried to identify the main journalistic discursive mechanisms that represent Greta. Textual analysis enabled us identification, interpretation and contextualization of the patterns of meaning (see also Negra et al, 2019). More importantly, in this kind of analysis, attention is paid not only to the content being communicated (e.g., themes) but also to the linguistic forms and contexts that shape language and interaction. From the participatory perspective, discourse analysis can therefore illuminate the moral, ethical, and cultural dimensions of the climate change issue. (Koteyko and Atanasova, 2016).

As Schäfer et al (2014) have highlighted, societal activity and particularly international climate summits have stronger impacts on issue attention in the case of climate change. Consequently, research refers to the period of one week prior to, and one week after the UN Climate Summit, held on 23 September 2019, i.e., from 16 until 30 September. Articles' corpus was selected by searching for keywords: climate change, Greta Thunberg, climate, summit, and which refer to the theme of the research with their content. Since the aim of the paper was not genre analysis, we decided to divide the research corpus into two groups: informative articles (in which the author's informative approach is present, such as news, report) and analytical-critical articles (dominated by analytical approach as what is a comment, topic / article). The purpose of this analysis was to show the extent to which journalists showed a step beyond informing the audience and involvement in the topic.

In the paper, the following research questions were addressed: (RQ1) What is the volume of coverage about climate change in both countries in the selected media? (RQ2) What are the main themes of the articles? (RQ3) What is the tone and stance of the analyzed articles?

Given the fact that the preliminary research demonstrated a significant number of articles on the activist Greta Thunberg, with a qualitative analysis of these articles we also wanted to provide a substantive analysis and analyse the views of journalists towards her activism and are there differences in views between the Slovenian

and Croatian media. We were especially interested in the questions (RQ4) what narratives are used about Greta, (RQ5) how was Greta Thunberg's speech represented within the analysed media.

Results

The research corpus encompassed 194 articles on mentioned Slovenian and Croatian online portals chosen according to the aforementioned criteria. The corpus of the Croatian websites' research amounted to 136 articles in total from 24sata.hr, hrtv.hr, index.hr, narod.hr, net.hr and vecernji.hr. Online portal index.hr had the largest percentage of articles in the research corpus, 57 articles (41.91%). It was followed by vecernji.hr with 24 articles (17.65%), hrtv.hr with 22 articles (16.18%), 24sata.hr with 16 articles (11.76%) and the least number of articles was at narod.hr (6.62%) and net.hr (5.88%), each having 8 articles (5.88%).

Table 1 The frequency of articles on Slovenian online portals according to the geographical focus of the articles

Tablica 1. Frekvencija članaka na slovenskim online portalima prema geografskom fokusu

	WORLD	%	EU	%	SLO	%	TOTAL	%
24ur.com	9	18.00	3	75.00	1	25.00	13	22.41
nova 24TV	5	10.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	5	8.62
SIOL.net	17	34.00	1	25.00	1	25.00	19	32.76
Slovenske novice	5	10.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	5	8.62
Svet24	5	10.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	5	8.62
TV SLO	9	18.00	0	0.00	2	50.00	11	18.97
TOTAL	50	100.00	4	100.00	4	100.00	58	100.00
%	86.21		6.90		6.90		100.00	

Source: processed by the author

The corpus of the research of Slovenian online portals 24ur.com, nova 24TV, SIOL.net, Slovenske novice, Scet24 and TV SLO encompassed 58 articles. Online portal SIOL.net had the largest percentage of articles in the research corpus, 19 articles (32.76%). Based on the number of articles it is followed by 24ur.com with 13 arti-

cles (22.41%), TV SLO with 11 articles (18.97%) and nova 24TV, Slovenske novice and Svet24 with 5 articles each, i.e., 8.62% each.

Table 2 The frequency of articles on Croatian online portals according to the geographical focus of the articles

Tablica 2. Frekvencija članaka na hrvatskim online portalima prema geografskom fokusu

	CRO	%	WORLD	%	EU	%	Total	%
24sata.hr	1	5.26	15	13.64	0	0.00	16	11.76
hrtv.hr	6	31.58	16	14.55	0	0.00	22	16.18
Index.hr	5	26.32	48	43.64	4	57.14	57	41.91
narod.hr	1	5.26	8	7.27	0	0.00	9	6.62
net.hr	1	5.26	7	6.36	0	0.00	8	5.88
večernji.hr	5	26.32	16	14.55	3	42.86	24	17.65
Total	19	100.00	110	100	7	100.00	136	100.00
%	13.97		80.88		5.15		100.00	

Source: processed by the author

Within the geographical focus of the research topic, Croatia was represented by 13.97% of the articles and Europe by 5.15% of the articles. By analysing the geographical focus of Croatia according to online portals, it is apparent that the largest number of articles (31.58%) was represented at the website of the public service media hrtv.hr, while somewhat less at online portals index.hr and vecernji.hr (each with 26.32%). Each of the remaining online portals in this research corpus (24 sata.hr, narod.hr and net.hr) published one article (5.26%). In the geographical focus of the researched topic, the world was most represented at index.hr (43.64%), followed by vecernji.hr (14,55%), hrtv.hr (14.55%) and 24sata.hr (13.64%). These are followed by narod.hr with 7.27% and net.hr with 6.36% of the articles. The geographic focus on Europe was only represented at the online portal index.hr (57.14%) and vecernji.hr (42.86%)

Table 3 Topic representation on Croatian and Slovenian online portals

Tablica 3. Prikaz tematike na hrvatskim i slovenskim online portalima

	CROATIA	%	SLOVENIA	%
Greta	34	25.00	23	39.66
Greta- Summit	17	12.50	2	3.45
Greta - Strike	9	6.62	1	1.72
Greta - Climate changes	2	1.47	1	1.72
Climate changes	50	36.76	19	32.76
Summit	14	10.29	2	3.45
Strike	10	7.35	9	15.52
Strike - Climate changes	0	0.00	1	1.72
TOTAL	136	100.00	58	100.00

Source: processed by the author

By analysing the topic, we wanted to reach an understanding of the content of the articles within the context of climate change as regards the Croatian and Slovenian media presentation of the researched topic. Considering that a significant number of articles contained the two topics that are relevant to this paper, we have decided to merge the topics in those cases, so as to show the content of the research corpus of the articles as accurately as possible. Table 3 shows the total amount of articles on 6 Croatian and 6 Slovenian new websites regarding the topic Greta T., Greta T.- Summit, Greta T.- Strike, Greta T. - Climate change, Climate change, Summit, Strike, and Strike- climate change. The table shows that the entire topic is present on Slovenian and Croatian online portals. One exception is the topic strike-climate change which has not been noted on the chosen Croatian online portals in the research period and on Slovenian online portals it has a representation of 1.72. Articles about climate change are the most represented ones on Croatian online portals (36.76%). Based on the percentage share, these are followed by articles about Greta Thunberg (25%), articles about Greta Thunberg in the context of the Summit (12.50%), the Summit (10.29%), climate strike (7.35%) and articles about Greta in the context of the climate strike, 6.62%. 1.47% of articles about Greta Thunberg in the context of climate change have been published while articles about climate change in the context of the strike were not noted. Chosen Slovenian online portals in the research period wrote mostly about Greta Thunberg with 39.66% and climate change with 32.76% of articles. A significantly smaller number of articles covered the climate strike with 15.52%. The Summit and Greta in the context of the Summit were the

least covered with 3.45% each and Greta in the context of the climate strike and the climate strike in the context of climate change with 1.72% each.

Table 4 The attitudes according to the topics - a comparison of Croatian and Slovenian online portals

Tablica 4. Prikaz stavova prema tematikama – usporedba hrvatskih i slovenskih online portala

COU	ATT	1	%	2	%	3	%	4	%	5	%	6	%	7	%	8		%	
HR	POS	16	47.06	12	70.59	8	88.89	1	50.00	41	82.00	7	50.00	10	100,00	0	0.00	95	69.85
	NEG	7	20.59	4	23.53	1	11.11	0	0.00	2	4.00	1	7.14	0	0.00	0	0.00	15	11.03
	POS/NEG	7	20.59	1	5.88	0	0.00	0	0.00	4	8.00	1	7.14	0	0.00	0	0.00	13	9.56
	NEU	4	11.76	0	0.00	0	0.00	1	50.00	3	6.00	5	35.71	0	0.00	0	0.00	13	9.56
	TOTAL	34	100,00	17	100,00	9	100,00	2	100,00	50	100,00	14	100,00	10	100,00	0	0.00	136	100,00
SLO	POS	16	69.57	2	100,00	1	100,00	0	0.00	16	84.21	1	50.00	9	100,00	1	100,00	46	79.31
	NEG	5	21.74	0	0.00	0	0.00	1	100,00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	6	10.34
	POS/NEG	2	8.70	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	2	3.45
	NEU	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	3	15.79	1	50.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	4	6.90
	TOTAL	23	100,00	2	100,00	1	100,00	1	100,00	19	100,00	2	100,00	9	100,00	1	100,00	58	100,00

Source: processed by the author

Legend: 1-Greta T, 2- Greta T. – Summit, 3- Greta T. – Strike, 4. Greta T. - Climate change, 5- Climate change, 6- Summit, 7- Strike, 8- Strike - Climate change; COU- Country; ATT – attitude; POS- positive, NEG- negative, POS/NEG- positive/negative; NEU- neutral

Table 4 shows attitudes, the views which could be read from the content of the articles regarding the topic and the comparison of the views between Slovenian and Croatian online portals. The table shows that a positive view is present on the chosen Croatian online portals in the research period in 69.85% of the articles. There was 11.03% of articles with a negative view, 9.56% of those with a positive and negative view and 9.69% of those with a neutral view. Chosen Slovenian online portals also had the most articles with a positive view, with 79.31% of articles. There were 10.34% of articles with a negative view. A positive and negative view

was present in 3.45% of articles, while 6.90% of articles maintained a neutral view. By analysing the view based on the topic of the articles on Croatian online portals, it is apparent that a positive view of 47.06% was predominantly present in articles with the topic of Greta Thunberg. Both a positive and negative view was present in 20.59% of articles and there was an equal percentage of articles with a negative view. There were 11.76 neutral articles. The same topic on Slovenian online portals also had the most articles with a positive view, but with an increased percentage of 69.57%. Both a positive and negative view was present in 8.70% of articles, while there was approximately an equal percentage of 21.74% of articles with a negative view as there were on Croatian online portals. There were no noted articles with a neutral view. A positive view was noted in the article about Greta Thunberg in the context of the Summit on a Slovenian online portal. Regarding the same topic, articles with a positive view dominated on Croatian online portals with 70.59%. A negative view was noted in 23.53% of the articles, while both a positive and a negative view in one article, amounting to 5.88%. There was a similar situation with articles about Greta in the context of the climate strike. A positive view was noted in the article on a Slovenian online portal. Articles with a positive view dominated on Croatian online portals with 88.89%. A negative view was noted in one article, amounting to 11.11%. A negative view was noted on a Slovenian online portal about Greta Thunberg in the context of climate change, while on Croatian online portals both a positive and a negative view could be read in the equal percentage of 50%. 50% of articles on Croatian online portals and 50% of articles on Slovenian websites had a positive view on the topic of climate change. The remaining articles on Slovenian online portals have a neutral view, amounting to 50%, while the remaining percentage of articles on Croatian online portals is distributed in a different manner. The largest percentage of remaining articles, amounting to 35.71%, also has a neutral view. However, articles which have a negative view have also been noted in the amount of 7.14% and those having both a positive and a negative view in the amount of 7.14%. There were no articles on chosen Croatian online portals on the topic of climate change and climate strike, while on Slovenian online portals a positive view could be read.

By calculating the modes for the view of the entirety of the Slovenian media articles and the view of the entirety of the Croatian media articles we arrive at a conclusion that in the articles on Croatian online portals, the most frequent view is positive with a standard deviation of 1. In the articles on Slovenian online portals, the most frequent view is also positive with a standard deviation of 0.85. Overall, the view of the Slovenian and Croatian media, based on the response frequency, was positive with a standard deviation of 0.96, which indicates a lesser response dispersion.

Table 5 Comparison of genres and themes - a comparison of Croatian and Slovenian online portals

Tablica 5. Usporedba žanrova i tematike – usporedba hrvatskih i slovenskih online portala

COUNTRY	CROATIA				SLOVENIA			
Themes	1	%	2	%	1	%	2	%
Greta	30	88.24	4	11.76	20	86.96	3	13.04
Greta/Summit	16	94.12	1	5.88	2	100.00	0	0.00
Greta/Strike	7	77.78	2	22.22	1	100.00	0	0.00
Greta/Climate changes	2	100.00	0	0.00	1	100.00	0	0.00
Climate Changes	47	94.00	3	6.00	19	100.00	0	0.00
Summit	14	100.00	0	0.00	2	100.00	0	0.00
Strike	9	90.00	1	10.00	8	88.89	1	11.11
Strike/Climate changes	0	0.00	0	0.00	1	100.00	0	0.00
TOTAL	125	91.91	11	8.09	54	93.10	4	6.90

Legend: 1 - informative genres, 2 - analytical/critical genres

Croatian online portals have published 136 articles on climate changes. 91.91% of those articles were written in informative genres, while 8.09% were written in analytical/critical genres. Slovenian online portals have published 58 articles on the research topic. 93.10% of those were written in an informative, while 6.90% were written in analytical/critical genres. By analysing the journalistic approach to the topic, it is apparent that both the Slovenian and Croatian online portals wrote in an informative genre about the topic of Greta Thunberg (Croatia, 88,92%, Slovenia, 86,96%) and a smaller number of articles in analytical/critical journalistic forms (Croatia, 11,76%, Slovenia, 13,04%). Slovenian online portals wrote about the topic of Greta Thunberg in the context of the Summit, strike, climate change and on the topic of climate change and the Summit in an informative genre. Croatian online portals also wrote about the Summit and Greta in the context of climate change in an informative genre, while there were no noted articles on the strike in the context of climate change. Croatian online portals had 5.88% of analytical/critical articles about Greta in the context of the Summit, 22.22% about Greta T. in the context of the strike and 6% about climate change.

Celebritization of climate change: Media representations of Greta Thunberg in both countries

In the second part of the paper we use textual analysis to address the question of celebritization of climate change. In our sample, three main discursive strategies of representing Greta can be observed: Greta as a celebrity, Greta as an instrument of political control and Greta as a hysterical teenager. Moreover, positive representations of Greta Thunberg are present mostly in the media that have a very active, sometimes alarmist stance regarding the questions of climate change, whereas negative representations of the climate activist predominate in the media where the stance toward climate change ranges from scepticism to straightforward denial of scientific consensus regarding the issue.

Greta as a celebrity and a global icon

From the perspective of journalistic norms, the focus on celebrities is not surprising as Boykoff and Boykoff (2007) have identified personalization as one of most important norms that journalists adhere to. The ‘personalization’ norm refers to journalists’ focus on stories that emphasize the human-interest aspect of individuals’ trials and tribulations in favor of structural or institutional analyses, argue van Eck et al (2019). What is more, Boykoff and Goodman (2009: 401) have proposed a model called the Cultural Circuits of Climate Change Celebrities to understand and conceptualize celebrities, media and climate change politics and their potential effects at the same time giving this phenomenon a more relationally-informed register. On the other hand, they warn against negative sides of celebritization of climate change.

If we first look at the titles of the articles within this discursive strategy, an emphasis on her young age and positive effects of her efforts can be observed. For example: “A teenager from Sweden received an alternative nobel prize: ‘She inspired and spread political demands for immediate climate action’ (HINA, 2019) or “A girl from Sweden united the world and made Trump angry: It all started a year ago” (Sprečić, 2019). Very similar examples can be found in the Slovenian part of the sample, for example “The young activist criticized congressmen” (E. B., 2019) and even more extreme variants, such as “A Slovene TV host is an admirer of famous activist” (Slovenske novice, 30.9.2019) or “Swedish church: Greta Thunberg is next Jesus” (Cvjetovic, 2019). She is frequently described as inspiring, modest and wise as for example in the article from Slovene tabloid Slovenske novice:

Climate protests of young people and their older supporters are spreading around the world, and the 16-years old activist Greta Thunberg **inspires more and more people**. /.../ She is at the other side of the Atlantic from August, she is unstoppable, even wiser and experiences politicians praise her. The young Swed who shocked the parliament in her own county and then started protests for more responsible attitude towards the planet around the whole western worls, was invited by the Democratic party to visit the US Congress (E.B., 2019).

When she received an alternative Nobel prize almost all the media from both countries included in the sample reported about the event either neutral and factual as in the case of Slovene public service portal MMC RTVSLO (K. Št., 2019) and portal Net.hr (HINA, 2019) or extremely positive. Fore example, she was described as a global icon on Index.hr on more than one occasion: “The icon of young generations that protest against climate change, Greta protested on her own in front of the Swedish parliament 12 months ago, and her “school strike” draw the attention of social media after few weeks, and later also the attention of the world media and that is how “Fridays for future” were born (Duhaček, 2019).

Boykoff and Goodman (2009: 401) argue that previous debates in media and cultural studies on the effects of the mediaization of society and politics can be seen as situating celebrity-style politics into two camps – the “distraction” camp, which argues that this celebritization of climate change is nothing but that, and the “democratization” camp which celebrates the mediaization of politics as a new tool to fire up the imaginations of the public and increase participation and political discussion to foster civil society. In the case of Greta Thunberg, we could clearly talk about the later.

Greta as an instrument of policital manipulation and a “histerical teenager”

Contrary to above mentioned positive depictions, the representation of Greta as a tool in hand of political parties is the main negative discursive strategy in both countries such as Narod.hr in Croatia and Nova24TV.si in Slovenia. Here journalist oftenly use interpretive and very personal style of writing and deviate from established norms of balance and neutrality. In the below examples from both portals, the question of her mental health is also mentioned and connected to the question of political conspiracies. For example, in an article on Nova24tv.si with the title “Greta Thunberg is an exploited girl in the hands of George Soros, Bill and Melinda Gates and other influential people!” or in the opinion piece on Narod.hr:

Ever since the 16-years old environmental activist Greta Thunberg had a speech in the United Nations, met Pope Francis and represents the face of climate strikes at the end of the week, she is in the center of attention of the whole world. If anybody thought that she became the leading figure of climate protection by accident, they could not be more wrong. /.../ Activist against guns **David Hogg and the global establishment force Greta to the front line so she can promote their agenda even if this means that they are using a teenage girl with Asperger-syndrom** (Murn, 2019a)

Negative depictions of Greta Thunberg in these online sites go hand in hand with a general climate change denial stance of their editorial policy. Buettner (2010: 88) argues that climate change denial is connected to the question of the responsibility of the media, and of the social function of journalism and news as one of the prevalent forms mass media that communicate regarding the environment. According to her it is “particularly problematic if this kind of media coverage feeds off, rather than reports on, climate change denial, and fails to provide the historical and ideological contexts of that debate” (ibid.). A case of “feeding of” instead of “reporting on” climate denials are the articles about the letter of 500 scientists who deny climate change that were published in some of the online media.

500 scientists denied claims of environmental activist Greta Thunberg and the strongly emphasize: there is no climate crisis!

/.../ “People are suffering. People are dying. Entire ecosystems are collapsing. We are in the beginning of a mass extinction, and all you can talk about is money and fairy tales of eternal economic growth. How dare you!” 16-years old Greta Thunberg historically yelled on Monday in the UN. In a reply to the speech as much as 500 scientists publicly denied Greta’s claim that we are facing a climate crisis (Murn, 2019b).

More than 500 top scientists signed a Declaration against spreading a climate hysteria!

There are numerous top scientists around the world that deny global and ecologically fanatical movement for the fight against the climate change in which even children are drawn in as we can observe these days. Those who have grow up in totalitarian systems have very bad memories about including children in political propaganda so the majority of people around the world is feeling discomfort

by these protests by children around the world (Horvatić, 2019).

It was later revealed that the 500 experts that signed the declaration are not experts in the field of climate change but have research experience in a variety of fields, from engineering to business. Lastly, similar, but more personal discursive strategy of representing Greta Thunberg as a historical teenager can be observed in part of the sample. Here an observation by Koteyko and Atanasova (2016) that in climate change reporting discourses in digital media are increasingly mixing language with moving and still images, hyperlinks and sound to create meaning should be put forward. They emphasize that in such multimodal environments the use of non-linguistic forms to communicate ideas may predominate, and the different modes are often combined to convey complex concepts and attitudes (Koteyko and Atanasova, 2016). In our case this means that usually a negative article is also accompanied by a corresponding picture or/and video of Greta Thunberg as in the case of article on Nova24tv.si: “Greta shocked even more in her speech on Monday in the general assembly where she tried to impress the world leaders with well rehearsed speech, with a mix of tears and hysteria” (Murn, 2019c). The text was accompanied by a picture of Greta with an awkward facial expression. On the other hand, the tabloid Svet24 cited foreign media reports about an opinion of a psychologist from Australia about Greta:

Australian psychologist fiercely criticized Greta

Last week 150 million people went to streets because of her and she also criticized the world leaders. Australian psychologist thinks that we are dealing with a puppet that needs treatment. /.../ Australian psychologist dr. Michael Carr-Gregg compared Greta’s situation to the one with a teenage celebrity that finds herself under the spotlight all of the sudden. (J. P. 2019)

Painter et al. (2018: 3) emphasize that the new digital media players that try to compete with legacy media experiment with a wide range of formats popular on social media and that they pursue editorial innovation and distinctiveness by selecting different stories, angles or themes, adopting different tones in presenting news, and introducing or emphasising different voices not found as often in legacy media. In our sample this seems to be the case with negative stories and *ad hominem* attacks on Greta Thunberg such as for example Nova24TV.si in Slovenia, oftenly launch attacks that resemble online hate campaigns and that have no grounding in scientific consensus about the issue of climate change. In this context Murphy’s (2021: 194) point that Thunberg’s combination of confrontational rhetoric, committed activism,

lifestyle choices and public persona, connects her to some of the more foundational tropes and premises of environmentalism (apocalypticism, ecological jeremiad, importance of science). According to him, one of the defining aspects of Greta Thunberg's rise to eco-celebrity is how it has been anchored in media narratives of how she is ordinary yet transformative.

Conclusion

With the focus on online media in Slovenia and Croatia, the paper contributed to the diversification of current research on media representations of climate change. The research period was limited to the week before and after the UN Climate Summit was held with a lot of participants participating from all over the world. The Summit discussed climate change, issues of which have been especially intensified over the past years. Climate strikes all over the world further contributed to the aggravation of the issues, while they were also particularly presented in the media by the statement of Greta Thunberg, a girl who spoke very harshly at the Summit, urging for climate protection. In this paper, we wanted to examine the media presentation of the climate change topic from the perspective of the Slovenian and Croatian media and to point out the similarities and differences in reporting between two neighbouring states with special emphasis on Greta Thunberg, who stood out with her engagement and interested the media around the world in her activism. The research corpus encompassed 194 articles. The Croatian media articles in the researched corpus were represented with 70.10%, while the Slovenian ones were represented with 29.90%, which leads to the conclusion that the Croatian media, according to the predetermined research criteria, were more interested in monitoring the climate change. By comparing the number of articles in commercial and public media, it can be concluded that the public media share in Croatia amounted to 16.18% of the articles, while the public media share in Slovenia amounted to 18.97%.

In the research period, regarding the topic in the context of climate change, both the Croatian and Slovenian online portals mostly wrote about Greta Thunberg (Slovenia 39.66%, Croatia 25%) and climate changes (Slovenia 32.76, Croatia 36.76%). Overall, both the Croatian and Slovenian online portals mostly wrote about Greta Thunberg, 39.66, and in general about climate change, 32.76%. Even though one of the motives for writing a paper on the media monitoring of climate change was the Summit on Climate Changes, only 3.45% articles wrote about the Summit itself in the research period which could be explained as a motive to write about the other issues. This explanation is also supported by the fact that a girl, Greta Thunberg, appeared at the Summit, who inspired writings about herself in person and in the

context of her role in the fight to preserve the global climate with the contents of her speech and her way of expressing herself and her attitude.

Both the articles on the Croatian and Slovenian online portals had a positive view on the topic of the climate strike, which was to be expected, considering that this paper described all the articles as having a positive attitude, the contents of which articles, among others, write about the need to preserve the climate and prevent the harmful influence to the climate, which the climate strike is all about. Both the Croatian and Slovenian online portals' reporters predominantly approached the public with informative forms. A lesser number of articles both on the Slovenian and Croatian online portals was categorised as analytical/critical forms (Croatia, 8,09%, Slovenia, 6,90%)

In the qualitative analysis contested meanings of Greta Thunberg were highlighted and connected to the differences in the media. Discursive strategies that use negative representations of Greta are clearly connected to the right-wing online portals with a general stance towards denying climate change. As Boykoff and Goodman (2009: 405) have emphasized climate science–policy–celebrity arenas are highly contested, characterized by uncertain facts, disputed values and politicized alternatives for action, and the stakes and tensions will continue to grow as time goes on. Lastly, as Buettner (2010: 92) argued, the media provide one of the most prevalent interfaces between scientists, policy makers, and members of the general public. And this is only one of the reasons why reporting about climate change is especially important.

REFERENCES

- Ančić, B., Puđak, J. and M. Domazet (2016) “Vidimo li klimatske promjene u Hrvatskoj? Istraživanje stavova o nekim od aspekata klimatskih promjena u hrvatskom društvu”, *Hrvatski meteorološki časopis*, 51 (51), 27–45.
- Babić, M. (2017) *15 GODINA Povijest Indexa*, <https://www.index.hr/vijesti/clanak/15-godina-indexa-povijest/1011291.aspx>.
- Boykoff, M. T. and J. Timmons Roberts (2007) *Media coverage of climate changes: Current trends, strengths, weaknesses*. United Nations Development Programme background paper.
- Boykoff, M. T. and J. M. Boykoff (2007) “Climate change and journalistic norms: A case-study of US mass-media coverage”, *Geoforum*, 38 (6), 1190–1204.
- Boykoff, M. T. (2008) “The cultural politics of climate change discourse in UK tabloids”, *Political Geography*, 27, 549–569.

- Boykoff, M. T. i M. K. Goodman (2009) "Conspicuous redemption? Reflections on the promises and perils of the 'Celebrization' of climate change", *Geoforum*, 40, 395–406.
- Brüggemann, M. and S. Engesser (2014) "Between Consensus and Denial: Climate Journalists as Interpretive Community", *Science Communication*, 36 (4), 399–427.
- Buettner, A. (2010) "Climate Change in the Media: Climate Denial, Ian Plimer, and the Staging of Public Debate", *MEDIANZ Media Studies Journal of Aotearoa New Zealand*, 12 (1), 79–97.
- E. B. (2019) "Mlada aktivistka okrcala kongresnike", *Slovenske novice*, <https://www.slovenskenovice.si/novice/svet/mlada-aktivistka-okrcala-kongresnike-228396>.
- Cvjetovic, S. (2019) "Švedskacerkev: GretaThunbergjeKristusovanaslednica", *siol.net*, <https://siol.net/digisvet/novice/svedska-cerkev-greta-thunberg-je-kristusova-naslednica-508422>.
- Dayan, D. and E. Katz (1992) *Media events: The live broadcasting of history*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Duhaček, G. (2019) "Tko je Greta Thunberg, tinejdžerica o kojoj bruji cijeli svijet?", *Index.hr*, <https://www.index.hr/vijesti/clanak/tko-je-greta-thunberg-tinejdzerica-o-kojoj-bruji-cijeli-svijet/2118823.aspx>.
- GemiusAuding (2021) Croatia, <https://rating.gemius.com/hr/tree/8>.
- Günay, D., Emre, I. and M. Ersoy (2018) "Alternative media and the securitization of climate change in Turkey", *Alternatives: Global, Local, Political*, 1–19. doi: 10.1177/0304375418820384.
- J.P. (2019) "AvstralskipsihologostronadGretoThunberg", *svet24.si*, <https://novice.svet24.si/clanek/novice/svet/5d8bab44435f6/avstralski-psiholog-ostro-nad-greto-thunberg>.
- HINA (2019) "Švedska tinejdžerka dobila alternativnu Nobelovu nagradu: 'Nadahnila i proširila političke zahtjeve za hitne klimatske akcije'", *net.hr*, <https://net.hr/danas/svijet/svedska-tinejdzerka-dobila-alternativnu-nobelovu-nagradu-nadahnila-i-prosirila-politicke-zah-tjeve-za-hitne-klimatske-akcije/#>.
- Horvatić, P. (2019) "Više od 500 vrhunskih znanstvenika potpisalo Deklaraciju protiv širenja klimatske hysterije!", *narod.hr*, <https://narod.hr/svijet/vise-od-500-vrhunskih-znanstvenika-potpisalo-deklaraciju-protiv-sirenja-klimatske-hysterije>.
- Ivanuš, Ž. (2020) "Studija slučaja 24sata: mjesto edukativnih tema u tabloidnom novinarstvu", *Medijska istraživanja*, 26 (1), 109–128.
- K.Št. (2019) "GretaThunbergprejmnicaalternativneNobelovenagrade", *RTVSLO*, <https://www.rtvsl.si/svet/evropa/greta-thunberg-prejmnica-alternativne-nobelove-nagrade/500476>.

- Keller, T. R., Hase, V., Thaker, J., Mahl, D., Mike S. and M. S. Schäfer (2019) “News Media Coverage of Climate Change in India 1997–2016: Using Automated Content Analysis to Assess Themes and Topics”, *Environmental communication*, 14 (2), 219–235.
- Koteyko, N. and D. Atanasova (2016) “Discourse analysis approaches for assessing climate change communication and media representations”. In: *Oxford Encyclopedia of Climate Change Communication*. Oxford University Press.
- Königslöw, K. K., Post, S. and M. S. Schäfer (2019) “How news media (de-)legitimize national and international climate politics – A content analysis of newspaper coverage in five countries”, *The International Communication Gazette*, 81 (7), 1–23.
- McComas, K. and J. Shanahan (1999) “Telling Stories About Global Climate Change: Measuring the Impact of Narratives on Issues Cycles”, *Communication Research*, 26 (1), 30–57.
- Murn, H. (2019a), “Greta Thunberg je izkoriščana punčka v rokah Georgea Sorosa, Billa in Melinde Gates ter drugih vplivnežev!”, NOVA24tv.si, <https://nova24tv.si/svet/glavna-mentorica-okoljske-aktivistke-grete-thunberg-je-operativka-georga-sorosa-billa-in-melinde-gates/>.
- Murn, H. (2019b) “500 znanstvenikov postavilo na laž trditve okoljske aktivistke Grete Thunberg in odločno poudarjajo: podnebne krize ni!”, NOVA24tv.si, <https://nova24tv.si/svet/500-znanstvenikov-postavilo-na-laz-trditve-okoljske-aktivistke-grete-thunberg-in-odlocno-poudarjajo-podnebne-krize-ni/>.
- Murn, H. (2019c) “Tako je okoljska aktivistka Greta jezno obstala, ko jo je zasenčil ameriški predsednik Donald Trump in ji odvzel pozornost!”, Nova24tv.si, <https://nova24tv.si/svet/tako-je-okoljska-aktivistka-greta-obstala-z-zacudenjem-ko-jo-je-zasencil-ameriski-predsednik-donald-trump-in-ji-odvzel-pozornost/>.
- Murphy, P. D. (2021) “Speaking for the youth, speaking for the planet: Greta Thunberg and the representational politics of eco-celebrity”, *Popular Communication*, 19 (3), 193–206.
- Narod (2021) Impressum, <https://narod.hr/impressum>.
- Negra, D., O’Leary, E. and A. P. McIntyre (2019) “Broadcasting Irish Emigration in an era of global mobility”, *European Journal of Cultural Studies*, 22 (5-6), 849–866.
- Painter, J., Kristiansen, S. and M. S. Schäfer (2018) “How ‘Digital-born’ media cover climate change in comparison to legacy media: A case study of the COP 21 summit in Paris”, *Global Environmental Change*, 48, 1–10.

- Pralle, S. B. (2009) "Agenda-setting and climate change", *Environmental politics*, 18 (5), 781–799.
- Rohloff, A. (2019) *Climate Change, Moral Panics, and Civilization*. London: Routledge.
- Romps, D. M. and J. P. Retzinger (2019) "Climate news articles lack basic climate science", *Environmental Research Communications*. doi: 10.1088/2515-7620/ab37dd.
- Schäfer, M. S., Ivanova, A. and A. Schmidt (2014) "What drives media attention for climate change? Explaining issue attention in Australian, German and Indian print media from 1996 to 2010", *The International Communication Gazette*, 76 (2), 152–176.
- Schäfer, M. S. and I. Schlichting (2014) "Media Representations of Climate Change: A Meta-Analysis of the Research Field", *Environmental communication*, 8 (2), 142–160.
- Shi, W., Chen, C., Xiong, J. and H. Fu (2019) "What Framework Promotes Saliency of Climate Change Issues on Online Public Agenda: A Quantitative Study of Online Knowledge Community Quora", *Sustainability*, 11, 1619. doi:10.3390/su11061619.
- Sprečić, E. (2019) "Djevojka iz Švedske ujedinila je svijet i naljutila Trumpa: Sve je počelo prije godinu dana", *vecernji.hr*, <https://www.vecernji.hr/vijesti/djevojka-iz-svedske-ujedinila-je-svijet-i-naljutila-trumpa-1347706>.
- Grdić, Š., Krstinić Nižić, M. and M. Mamula (2017) "Povezanost klimatskih promjena i turizma: Multikriterijska analiza ocjenjivanja mjera prilagodbe", *Ekonom-ska misao i praksa*, (1), 171–185.
- van Eck, C. W., Mulder, B. C. and A. Dewulf (2019) "The Truth is not in the middle": Journalistic norms of climate change bloggers", *Global Environmental Change*, 59, 1–10.
- Trumbo, C. W. and J. Shanahan (2000) "Social research on climate change: where we have been, where we are and where we might go", *Public understanding of science*, 9, 199–204.

Između negiranja i „celebritizacije“: praćenje klimatskih promjena u slovenskim i hrvatskim *online* medijima

Vesna Kalajžić

Marijana Ražnjević Zdrilić

Dejan Jontes

SAŽETAK

Fenomen globalnog zagrijavanja i posljedice tog procesa izazovi su u današnjem modernom društvu. Ovaj rad motiviran je problematikom i medijskim napisima o klimatskim štrajkovima koji su se dogodili diljem svijeta u 2019. godini i UN-ovim Summitom o klimatskim akcijama, koji se odvijao u rujnu iste godine u New Yorku. Posebnu medijsku pažnju izazvala je švedska klimatska aktivistica Greta Thunberg čiji je nastup na Summitu izazvao poseban interes medija diljem svijeta. Cilj rada je istražiti medijsku sliku klimatskih promjena u hrvatskim i slovenskim online medijima. Prema kriteriju praćenja čitanosti online portala (Alexa.com) istraživanje je uključilo hrvatske online portale: 24sata.hr, Index.hr, Net.hr, Narod.hr, Vecernji.hr, Net.hr, te slovenske online portale: 24ur.com, nova 24TV, SIOL.net, Slovenske novice, Svet24, TV SLO. U radu je primijenjena metoda kvalitativne i kvantitativne analize sadržaja. Istraživački korpus obuhvatio je 194 članka, od kojih je 136 objavljeno u hrvatskim, a 58 u slovenskim online medijima. U fokusu istraživanja su opseg izvještavanja o klimatskim promjenama, identifikacija glavnih tema i stavova te pitanje „celebritizacije“ samog problema. Rezultati istraživanja pokazali su da postoje značajne razlike u prezentaciji pitanja klimatskih promjena s obzirom na slovenske i hrvatske online medije, posebno s obzirom na prezentaciju aktivizma Grete Thunberg.

Ključne riječi: klimatske promjene, usporedna analiza sadržaja, tekstualna analiza, „celebritizacija“, internetski mediji, Hrvatska, Slovenija